Annotated Bibliography

Identify and Respond to Bias in Tenure Decisions

Barriers to BIPOC Faculty Retention

Turner, C. S. V., González, J. C., & Wood, J. L. (2008). Faculty of color in academe: What 20 years of literature tells us. *Journal of Diversity in Higher Education,* 1(3), 139-168. https://doi.org/10.1037/a0012837

> *This synthesis of 252 publications provides a general overview of the barriers to career progress and retention for BIPOC faculty in academia.*

Inequality in Tenure and Promotion Standards

Azhar, S. & DeLoach McCutcheon, K. P. (2021). How Racism Against BIPOC Faculty Operates in Social Work Academia. *Advances in Social Work*, 21(2/3), 3960420. http://dx.doi.org/10.18060/24118

> *BIPOC faculty are less likely to be promoted or tenured, or have access to social networks within academia, than White colleagues. In particular, BIPOC women experience a disproportionate burden of emotional labor, are often tokenized, and feel under pressure to monitor their appearance and self-expression.*

Cate, L., Ward, L. W. M., & Ford, K. S. (2022). Strategic Ambiguity: How Pre-Tenure Faculty Negotiate the Hidden Rules of Academia. *Innovative Higher Education*, 134. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10755-022-09604-x

> *Faculty across different racial groups consistently perceive the tenure process to be ambiguous and reliant on tacit criteria. This ambiguity leads to racial bias, as White faculty are able to rely on their privilege to access hidden information about tenure expectations.*

Knight, W. B. (2010). Sink or Swim: Navigating the Perilous Waters of Promotion and Tenure: What's Diversity Got to Do with It? *Studies in Art Education*, 52(1), 84-87. https://doi.org/10.1080/00393541.2010.11518825

> *BIPOC faculty are more likely than White faculty to face barriers to career advancement due to the all-or-nothing, "publish or perish" nature of tenure at research universities.*

Unequal Service Burden and Invisible Work

Cleveland, D. R., Sailes, D. J., Gilliam, D. E., & Watts, J. (2018). A Theoretical Focus on Cultural Taxation: Who Pays for It in Higher Education. *Advances in Social Sciences Research Journal*, 5(10). https://doi.org/10.14738/assrj.510.5293

> *Faculty of color participate in uncompensated work on top of their official workload, including serving as advisors and mentors to BIPOC students, serving on DEIJ committees, and conducting research on communities of color. This extra work can lead to burnout and attrition.*

Jimenez, M. F., Laverty, T. M., et al. (2019). Underrepresented faculty play a disproportionate role in advancing diversity and inclusion. *Nature Ecology & Evolution*, 3, 1030-1033. https://doi.org/10.1038/s41559-019-0911-5

> *A survey of 469 biologists found that faculty of color disproportionately engage in DEIJ-related service work compare to White faculty and are not credited for this work in the tenure process.*

O'Meara, K., Culpepper, D., Misra, J., & Jaeger, A. (2021). Equity-Minded Faculty Workloads: What We Can and Should Do Now. *American Council on Education*. https://www.acenet.edu/Documents/Equity-Minded-Faculty-Workloads.pdf

> *Promotion, tenure, and faculty workload assignments lack transparent, equitable ways to measure contributions and reward excellence in areas such as diversity work and mentoring, leading to inequities in BIPOC and women faculty's workloads and career advancement.*

Bias in Student Evaluations of Teaching

American Sociological Association (2019). Statement on Student Evaluations of Teaching. https://www.asanet.org/sites/default/files/asa_statement_on_student_evaluations_of_teaching_feb132020.pdf

> *The American Sociological Association released this statement, endorsed by 20+ additional disciplinary associations acknowledging the measurable gender and racial bias in student evaluations and recommending five evidence-based practices to use as alternatives in faculty personnel decisions.*

Bavishi, A., Madera, J. M., & Hebl, M. R. (2010). The effect of professor ethnicity and gender on student evaluations: Judged before met. *Journal of Diversity in Higher Education, 3*(4), 245–256. https://doi.org/10.1037/a0020763

> *Students evaluate Black professors as less competent and less legitimate than White faculty.*

Boring, A.; Ottoboni, K., & Stark, P. B. (2016). Student evaluations of teaching (mostly) do not measure teaching effectiveness. *ScienceOpen Research* 0(0), 1.11. doi: 10.14293/S2199-1006.1.SOR-EDU.AETBZC.v1

> *Student evaluations are more likely to be influenced by students' grade expectations and identity-based biases than by teacher effectiveness as measured by students' performance on a post-course examination.*

Chávez, K., & Mitchell, K. (2020). Exploring Bias in Student Evaluations: Gender, Race, and Ethnicity. *PS: Political Science & Politics*, 53(2), 270-274. doi:10.1017/S1049096519001744

> *Female faculty of color receive lower ratings on student evaluations than White male faculty.*

Deslauriers, L., McCarty, L. S., Miller, K., Callaghan, K., & Kestin, G. (2019). Measuring actual learning versus feeling of learning in response to being actively engaged in the classroom. *Applied Physical Sciences*, 116(39), 19251-19257. https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1821936116

> *In a randomized study, students who participated in active instruction using pedagogical best practices learned more, but rated their perception of learning lower, than students who attended a lecture on the same content.*

Nontraditional and Multidisciplinary Research

Chalmers, D. (2010). Progress and challenges to the recognition and reward of the Scholarship of Teaching in higher education. *Higher Education Research & Development*, 30(1), 25-38. https://doi.org/10.1080/07294360.2011.536970

> *Faculty who specialize in the scholarship of teaching and learning (SoTL) are less likely to earn tenure than those who conduct more traditional research.*

Phaneuf, M., Lomas, J., McCutcheon, C., Church, J., & Wilson, D. Square Pegs in Round Holes: The Relative Importance of Traditional and Nontraditional Scholarship in Canadian Universities. (2007). *Science Communication*, 28(4), 501-518. doi:10.1177/1075547007302213

> *Deans and promotion committee members consistently rate research as more important than teaching or service, and rank traditional research outputs advantageously compared to nontraditional outputs.*

Narayan, B., Luca, E., Tiffen, B., England, A., Booth, M., & Boateng, H. (2018). Scholarly Communication Practices in Humanities and Social Sciences: A Study of Researchers' Attitudes and Awareness of Open Access. *Open Information Science*, 2(1), 168-180. https://doi.org/10.1515/opis-2018-0013

> *Researchers place more value on journal impact factor than with making their work more findable and raising awareness, likely due to institutional policy that values impact factor over other measures of reach and communication.*

Rhoten, D. & Parker A. (2004). Risks and rewards of an interdisciplinary research path. *Science*, 306(5704), 2046. https://doi.org/10.1126/science.1103628

> *Graduate students[1] are more likely to conduct interdisciplinary research than tenure-stream faculty, but also identify long-term risks to career advancement related to an interdisciplinary focus.*

Secret, M., Leisey, M., Lanning, S., Polich, S., & Schaub, J. (2012). Faculty perceptions of the scholarship of teaching and learning: Definition, activity level and merit considerations at one university. *Journal of the Scholarship of Teaching and Learning*, 11(3), 1–20. Retrieved from https://scholarworks.iu.edu/journals/index.php/josotl/article/view/1824

> *Pretenure faculty[1] are more likely than tenured faculty to consider SoTL to be research even if it is not published in a journal or other traditional venue. This article also argues that lack of clear evaluation policy in the tenure and promotion process likely limits faculty's contributions to SoTL.*

---

[1] As graduate programs and university faculty slowly diversify, graduate students and early-career/pretenure faculty are more likely to identify as BIPOC than senior and tenured faculty.

eab.com